



MINUTES OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING held at 7:00 pm on Wednesday 23 July 2025 in the Alverne Room, St John's Hall, Alverton Street, Penzance.

PRESENT JS Power (Chair)
B Jackson (Vice-Chair)

KM Baker
P Lapin
SJ Reynolds
MA Wilson

Also present: Councillor Jim McKenna, James Hardy (Town Clerk) and Elliot Ridington (Democratic Services and Governance Officer).

31. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

Councillors Broadhurst and Martin were absent without having provided apologies.

32. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

In accordance with the Council's Code of Conduct:-

Councillors Baker, Jackson, Lapin, Power, Reynolds and Wilson declared non-registerable interests in Application No. 6 – PA25/04354 'Landscaping works. Penzance Town Council, Penlee Centre, Penlee Park, Penzance.' as Members of Penzance Council, the applicant, which stood to benefit financially from the proposal, should it be approved.

33. EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC

There were no confidential matters to be considered.

34. TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 2 JULY 2025

Following consideration, it was

RESOLVED that the Minutes of the meeting held on 2 July 2025 be approved as a true and accurate record and signed by the Chair.

(Proposed: Councillor Lapin; seconded: Councillor Jackson)

Vote; Councillors Baker, Jackson, Lapin, Power and Wilson in favour. Councillor Reynolds abstained.

35. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION



Councillor McKenna and two members of the public were in attendance and spoke against Application No. 1 – PA25/03633 ‘Redevelopment for retirement living accommodation for older people (sixty years of age and/or partner over fifty-five years of age) comprising 56 retirement apartments and six retirement cottages including communal facilities, access, car parking and landscaping. Former Lidl Site, Promenade, Penzance.’

A member of the public was in attendance and spoke in favour of Application No. 1 – PA25/03633 ‘Redevelopment for retirement living accommodation for older people (sixty years of age and/or partner over fifty-five years of age) comprising 56 retirement apartments and six retirement cottages including communal facilities, access, car parking and landscaping. Former Lidl Site, Promenade, Penzance.’

36. NEW AND AMENDED PLANNING APPLICATIONS

Following consideration, it was unanimously

RESOLVED that the comment of ‘no objection’ to the planning applications set out in Appendix B to the Agenda be approved.

(Proposed: Councillor Jackson; seconded: Councillor Lapin)

The Committee then considered, in total, ten new and amended planning applications and its comments and votes in relation to Appendix A are as detailed below:-

	APP. NO.	APPLICANT	DEVELOPMENT	DECISION	RECORDED VOTE CLLRS PRESENT: JS Power (Chair) B Jackson (Vice-Chair) KM Baker P Lapin SJ Reynolds MA Wilson
1.	PA25/03633	Churchill Living	Redevelopment for retirement living accommodation for older people (sixty years of age and/or partner over fifty-five years of age) comprising 56 retirement apartments and six retirement cottages including communal facilities, access, car parking and landscaping. Former Lidl Site, Promenade, Penzance	Objection on the following grounds:- 1. The proposal fails to accord with the aims and intentions of Paragraph 172 of the National Planning Policy Framework, particularly section b) <i>'safeguarding land from development that is required, or likely to be required, for current or future flood management'</i> . 2. The proposal fails to accord with the aims and intentions of Policy 26 of the Cornwall Local Plan – <i>'Flood Risk Management and Coastal Change'</i> .	Unanimous.



	APP. NO.	APPLICANT	DEVELOPMENT	DECISION	RECORDED VOTE CLLRS PRESENT: JS Power (Chair) B Jackson (Vice-Chair) KM Baker P Lapin SJ Reynolds MA Wilson
				3. The proposal fails to accord with the aims and intentions of Policy CC1 of the Climate Emergency Development Plan Document, particularly 1.(b) ' <i>new development will only be permitted within the coastal vulnerability zone where it can be demonstrated that it would not impair the ability of communities and the natural environment /biodiversity to adapt sustainably to the impacts of coastal change (including coastal squeeze)</i> ' and 1(c) ' <i>new</i> '	

	APP. NO.	APPLICANT	DEVELOPMENT	DECISION	RECORDED VOTE CLLRS PRESENT: JS Power (Chair) B Jackson (Vice-Chair) KM Baker P Lapin SJ Reynolds MA Wilson
				<i>development will only be permitted within the coastal vulnerability zone where it can be demonstrated that it will be safe through its planned lifetime, without increasing risk to life or property’.</i> 4. The proposal, due to its scale, massing, density and height, is of a poor-quality design and represents a contrived form of development, thereby failing to accord with the aims and intentions of Paragraph 131 of the National Planning Policy Framework	



	APP. NO.	APPLICANT	DEVELOPMENT	DECISION	RECORDED VOTE CLLRS PRESENT: JS Power (Chair) B Jackson (Vice-Chair) KM Baker P Lapin SJ Reynolds MA Wilson
				and Policy 12 of the Cornwall Local Plan. 5. The proposal conflicts with the aims and intentions of Policy DDH1 of the Penzance Neighbourhood Plan, particularly <i>'Where a site is prominent in its surroundings, the use of white render or similar finishes should in general be avoided.'</i> 6. The proposal fails to accord with the aims and intentions of Paragraph DDH8 of the Penzance Neighbourhood Plan, particularly 1.iii) <i>'where it can be evidenced there is no</i>	

	APP. NO.	APPLICANT	DEVELOPMENT	DECISION	RECORDED VOTE CLLRS PRESENT: JS Power (Chair) B Jackson (Vice-Chair) KM Baker P Lapin SJ Reynolds MA Wilson
				<i>alternative but to connect to combined sewers, that this will have no adverse impact on capacity' and 1.vii 'that they will have no adverse impact on the Mounts Bay Marine Conservation Zone.'</i> Proposed - Cllr Reynolds Seconded - Cllr Wilson	
2.	PA25/03269	Mark & Emma Rowse	Deconversion of property from flats to one self and custom build family home with annexe. Proposed removal of current modern extensions to rear south west elevation with alterations and upgrade to rationalise. Removal of conservatory to south east elevation. Reinstatement of french doors. Removal of small extension	No objection. Proposed - Cllr Lapin Seconded - Cllr Wilson	Unanimous.

	APP. NO.	APPLICANT	DEVELOPMENT	DECISION	RECORDED VOTE CLLRS PRESENT: JS Power (Chair) B Jackson (Vice-Chair) KM Baker P Lapin SJ Reynolds MA Wilson
			providing landing and steps to first floor access to north west. Internal alterations forming a large family home with annexe. Alterations of 2no. door openings to windows, 1no. window to a door. General upgrades and repairs to building fabric. Alverne Hay, Alexandra Road, Penzance		
3.	PA25/04649	Mr R Stevenson	Partial Retention of Ground Floor Commercial Unit and Conversion of Upper Floors and Rear Ground Floor to Residential Use (4 No. Flats). 40-41 Causewayhead, Penzance	No objection. Proposed - Cllr Wilson Seconded - Cllr Reynolds	Councillors Baker, Jackson, Power, Reynolds and Wilson in favour. Councillor Lapin against.
4.	PA25/04316	Mrs Elizabeth Gaillard	Change of use of annexe to separate residential flat. 4 Garth Road, Newlyn	No objection. Proposed - Cllr Reynolds Seconded - Cllr Wilson	Unanimous.

	APP. NO.	APPLICANT	DEVELOPMENT	DECISION	RECORDED VOTE CLLRS PRESENT: JS Power (Chair) B Jackson (Vice-Chair) KM Baker P Lapin SJ Reynolds MA Wilson
5.	PA25/02807	Startzone Ltd	Conversion of first floor store to dwelling including retention of new roof. 38 The Strand, Newlyn, Penzance	No objection. Proposed - Cllr Reynolds Seconded - Cllr Lapin	Unanimous.
6.	PA25/04354	Mr J Hardy, Penzance Town Council	Landscaping works. Penzance Town Council, Penlee Centre, Penlee Park, Penzance	This application was not considered by the Planning Committee as all of those Members present had declared non-registerable interests in the matter as Members of Penzance Council, the applicant, which stood to benefit financially from the proposal, should it be approved.	
7.	PA25/04470 LISTED BLDG	Mr M Frey	Internal refurbishment and alterations. Flat 5, 38 Chapel Street, Penzance	No objection. Proposed – Cllr Lapin Seconded – Cllr Power	Unanimous.

	APP. NO.	APPLICANT	DEVELOPMENT	DECISION	RECORDED VOTE CLLRS PRESENT: JS Power (Chair) B Jackson (Vice-Chair) KM Baker P Lapin SJ Reynolds MA Wilson
8.	PA25/03630 LISTED BLDG	Mr Paul Iseard	Replacement of a pair of sash windows in a single frame in the front elevation roof. Top Flat, Armada House, 32 Chapel Street, Penzance	No objection. Proposed – Cllr Lapin Seconded – Cllr Wilson	Unanimous.
9.	PA25/02743	Keith Carlisle	Replace roof, re-point front and rear granite elevation; repair to rear upper floor render, but replace if necessary; re-point/re-render chimney stack. 2 Dumbarton Terrace, Mousehole	No objection. Proposed – Cllr Wilson Seconded – Cllr Jackson	Unanimous.
10.	PA25/04553	Ms Abbie Bannerman, Co-Op	Advertisement Consent for 1no internally luminated digital display screen positioned inside the store advertising deals, Produce etc. Co-Operative Retails Services Limited, 115 - 117 Market Jew Street, Penzance	No objection. Proposed – Cllr Lapin Seconded – Cllr Wilson	Unanimous.

37. TO NOTE ANY RESPONSES PROVIDED UNDER THE ‘LOCAL COUNCIL PROTOCOL’

Since the last meeting of the Committee, the following responses had been provided in relation to applications considered under the Local Council Protocol:-

PA25/02351 - Proposed paved area for off street parking and the installation of a car charging point to include removal of section of boundary wall to front. - Maisonette, Incledon Villa, Trewithen Road, Penzance

‘Penzance Council ‘agrees to disagree’ with the Planning Officers recommendation for refusal.’

(Members were not consulted as, due to this being a ‘householder’ application, there was no opportunity to request that the matter was determined by the West Sub-Area Planning Committee, meaning that the only option available was to ‘agree to disagree’)

PA25/04362 - Replacement roof to existing rear extension. - 2 Kitts Court, Chapel Street, Penzance

‘Penzance Council ‘agrees to disagree’ with the Planning Officer.’

(Members were not consulted as, due to this being a ‘householder’ application, there was no opportunity to request that the matter was determined by the West Sub-Area Planning Committee, meaning that the only option available was to ‘agree to disagree’)

38. MOTIONS ON NOTICE**a) South West Rail Resilience Programme**

The South West Rail Resilience Programme was the package of works required to stabilise and protect the mainline into Devon and Cornwall along the coastal stretch through Dawlish and Teignmouth, which was at increasing risk from extreme weather events and rising sea levels.

A Member reported that the Government had announced that:-

“The delivery of the final phase of the South West Rail Resilience Programme is on hold but preliminary works to support cliff monitoring and drainage are progressing. We have already invested significantly in securing the cliffs and making the coastline more resilient in the South West and need to focus our investment on other projects around the country. We will keep this scheme under review as the preliminary works complete and for funding at future fiscal events.”

This decision, announced by the Government, effectively postponed completion of this vital work indefinitely.

During the debate, Members stated that the motion could be strengthened and suggested



a number of changes and additions to it.

Following consideration, it was unanimously

RESOLVED that

1. Dismay be expressed at the decision to place on hold the delivery of the final phase of the South West Rail Resilience Programme.
2. A statement to this effect be sent to the Minister for Rail, Lord Peter Hendy of Richmond Hill.
3. HM Government be urged to reconsider and reintroduce said programme at the earliest opportunity.

(Proposed: Councillor Reynolds; seconded: Councillor Lapin)

39. APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER(S) TO REPRESENT PENZANCE COUNCIL

There were no matters which required the appointment of Members to represent Penzance Council.

40. MATTERS ARISING FOR REPORT ONLY

There were no matters arising for report.

Meeting closed at 7:55 pm

Chair
13 August 2025